

SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600 • San Francisco, California 94102 (415) 352-3600 • Fax: (415) 352-3606 • www.bcdc.ca.gov

February 28, 2014

TO: All Design Review Board Members

FROM: Ellen Miramontes, Bay Design Analyst [415/352-3643 ellenm@bcdc.ca.gov]
Michelle Burt Levenson, Permit Analyst [415/352-3618 michellel@bcdc.ca.gov]

**SUBJECT: Bay Trail Alignment Options, along Marina Boulevard between Scott and Baker Streets,
City and County of San Francisco**
(For Board consideration March 10, 2014)

Project Summary

Permittee. City and County of San Francisco, Recreation and Parks Department

Project Representatives. Mary Hobson, City and County of San Francisco, Recreation and Parks Department; and Meghan Tiernan, City and County of San Francisco, Department of Public Works.

Background. On November 4, 2010, the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission approved Material Amendment No. Two to BCDC Permit No. 2007.006. This amended permit authorized the City and County of San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department to renovate existing marina facilities and install a variety of public access improvements within the San Francisco Marina West Basin, located in the San Francisco Marina, along the northern waterfront between Crissy Field and Fort Mason (Exhibits A and C). The amended permit issued for the project includes Special Condition II-B-3, which requires the permittee, the Recreation and Parks Department, to do the following:

“San Francisco Bay Trail Improvement Plan

- a. **City and County of San Francisco Participation.** The permittee shall designate a principal staff liaison to work in coordination with the City and County of San Francisco (CCSF) Department of Public Works, the Golden Gate National Recreation Area (NPS), the San Francisco Bay Trail Project, the Commission staff, marina tenants, and other primary stakeholders to finalize a conceptual design of a preferred Bay Trail alignment along Marina Boulevard between Scott and Baker Streets, in the City and County of San Francisco.
- (1) **Bay Trail Planning – Project Scope and Data Collection.** By December 31, 2011, the CCSF Recreation and Parks Department shall work in collaboration with the CCSF Department of Public Works and other relevant CCSF departments to develop a scope of work for the community planning process to evaluate Bay Trail alignment options along Marina Boulevard and collect data to be used in the planning process. The scope of work for the community planning process shall include commencement and completion dates of the planning process, the approximate number of community meetings, a list of stakeholders, and project milestones. Additionally, the permittee shall begin collecting data on pedestrian and bicycle usage, vehicular traffic patterns, and parking counts to the extent feasible in the vicinity of Marina Boulevard between Scott Street and Baker Street.



Making San Francisco Bay Better

- (2) **Community Planning Process and Final Bay Trail Conceptual Design.** By December 31, 2012, in coordination with the above-listed parties, the permittee shall complete a community planning process that results in the creation of a final conceptual design of a preferred Bay Trail alignment along Marina Boulevard between Scott Street and Baker Street. The planning process shall result in a design of a Bay Trail segment that provides a high quality bicycle, pedestrian, and general visitor experience and addresses the following:
- (a) The existing underlying rail tracks within the NPS right-of-way;
 - (b) The trail standards of the San Francisco Bay Trail Project;
 - (c) The potential for existing parking relocation, either within the existing area or at an off-site location;
 - (d) The jurisdiction of the CCSF Public Works Department; and
 - (e) The jurisdiction of the CCSF Recreation and Park Department.

At the Commission staff discretion, the draft conceptual design may be reviewed by the Commission's Design Review Board prior to the preparation of a final conceptual design.

- (3) **Submittal of Final Bay Trail Conceptual Design, Schedule and Cost Estimate.** By March 1, 2013, the permittee shall submit to Commission staff a final conceptual design of the preferred Bay Trail alignment, which: (a) responds to the advice of the Commission's Design Review Board; and (b) includes an estimate of construction costs needed to implement the preferred Bay Trail alignment. Improvements implementing the final conceptual design for the Bay Trail will require authorization through a future amendment to this amended permit or the appropriate permit held by the City and County of San Francisco (Material Amendment No. Two)...."

As described above under "Community Planning Process and Final Bay Trail Conceptual Design", staff is requesting that the Board review and provide advice on the draft conceptual design options for the Bay Trail alignment prior to the preparation of a final conceptual design.

Current Conditions. The segment of Bay Trail that is the focus of the Board's review is approximately 1,000 feet long and 38 feet wide, and currently supports both a multi-use pathway and parking for berth holders of the West Harbor Marina and the public. An 18-foot-wide section of the pathway immediately adjacent to the waterfront is controlled by the Parks and Recreation Department, and the remaining 20-foot-wide section is controlled by the Department of Public Works (Exhibit E). Adjacent to the pathway are 91 marina berths that are accessed by three separate gangways. A total of 51 vehicular parking spaces are located along this section of pathway, 15 of which are reserved for permitted marina berth holders and 36 of which are open to the public and marina berth holders during specified hours and days of the week (Exhibits E and F).

Public Process: In an effort to comply with Special Condition II-B-3 of the amended BCDC permit, the Department of Public Works and the Recreation and Parks Department measured usage of the pathway during 18 events in 2011. Usage was measured over one-hour intervals, in the morning, afternoon and evening during the fall, summer and winter months and was categorized as parking, bicycle or pedestrian. As depicted in Exhibit B, vehicular use of the pathway constituted approximately two-percent of the activity along the pathway, with the heaviest usage split amongst pedestrians and bicyclists depending on the time of year.

To date, a total of two community meetings have been held regarding the project. During the first meeting, which occurred on September 26, 2013, a project introduction was provided and community input was gathered regarding usage of the space. Based on input from the public and results of the usage study, five design options (Exhibits F through I) were prepared and presented to the public at a second meeting, held on December 11, 2013. Feedback from the public regarding the presented design options and usage along the pathway was gathered at this second meeting and an online survey was available to the public from December 17, 2013, through January 10, 2014.

Option 1 (maintain current configuration-Exhibit F) and Option 2a (relocate all parking-Exhibit G) received the most support by respondents. Options to limit or reduce parking by providing loading zones or to relocate parking to the south received little support.

A final public meeting is tentatively scheduled for April 24, 2014, from 6:00 to 7:30 pm at the Moscone Recreation Center where the proposed final conceptual plans will be presented.

Board Advice. The Board's advice is sought on the following two issues:

1. **Whether Design Options 1 through 4 Meet the Requirements of the Permit Condition.** The Board should advise on whether the configurations shown under Design Options 1 through 4 adequately meet the requirements of Special Condition II-B-3, including whether the options, "...provide a high quality bicycle, pedestrian and general visitor experience..." that "...address...(b) the Trail standards of the San Francisco Bay Trail Project; [and] (c) the potential for existing parking relocation, either within the existing area or at an off-site location;...".
2. **Whether the Design Options Provide for Safe Pedestrian and Bicycle Use.** While Design Option 2A involves relocating all parking to a different location, the remaining design options involve a mix of vehicular parking and pedestrian/bicycle usage. The Board should advise on and provide recommendations for specific design features that should be employed to minimize safety concerns and potential conflicts between different users.